

**North Yorkshire Council**

**Community Development Services**

**Richmond (Yorks) Area Constituency Committee  
14<sup>th</sup> April 2024**

**ZB23/01933/LBC - Ground floor alterations.**

**At: Horseshoe Inn, West Rounton, DL6 2LL**

**On behalf of: Mr. S. Taylor**

**Report of the Assistant Director Planning– Community Development services**

**1.0 PURPOSE OF THE REPORT**

- 1.1 To determine an application for listed building consent for ground floor alterations.
- 1.2 This application is brought to the Planning Committee due to the level of local objection. A concurrent planning application for the change of use from existing public house to dwelling has been submitted and is also a committee agenda item (ref no. ZB23/01932/FUL).
- 1.3 It is recommended that listed building be granted subject to a condition relating to a schedule of works for the limited internal alterations to be submitted prior to the commencement of development.

**2.0 SUMMARY**

**RECOMMENDATION:** That listed building consent is **GRANTED**.

- 2.1 The application seeks listed building consent ground floor internal alterations to facilitate the conversion to a single dwelling. The only external alteration proposed is to remove the modern advertisement signage above the entrance door on the principal elevation.
- 2.2 The issues of the heritage impact of the use are dealt with in the Full application. This application deals only with the physical alterations to the listed building.

ZB23/01932/FUL & ZB23/01933/LBC

02/04/2024



 **NORTH YORKSHIRE COUNCIL**  
Civic Centre, Stone Cross, Rotary Way,  
Northallerton DL6 2UU  
© Crown copyright [and database rights] 2024 OS AC0000825864

  
1:1,250

### 3.0 PRELIMINARY MATTERS

3.1 Access to the case file on Public Access can be found here:-

[Documents for ZB23/01933/LBC](#)

3.2 The following applications related to the application site are detailed below:

80/1557/LBC - Application for Listed Building Consent For The Re-Rendering And Colouring Of Front Elevation Of Existing Public House. Approved. 24.07.1980

82/0676/FUL - Extension to Existing Public House to provide Increased Living Accommodation. Approved. 26.08.1982

2/89/169/0024C - Application for Listed Building Consent for alterations to existing public house. Approved. 05.05.1989

2/92/169/0024F - Extension to existing public house and living accommodation. Approved. 27.08.1992

2/92/169/0024G - Application for Listed Building Consent for an extension to existing public house and living accommodation. Approved. 27.08.1992

10/00748/LBC and 10/00747/FUL. Single storey extension to existing pub, installation of 3 roof lights and 2 replacement windows, alterations to outbuildings, alterations to form a self contained flat and formation of a car park as amended by email and plan received on 10 June 2010. Approved. 11.06.2010

11/02305/FUL - Demolition of existing outbuilding and construction of a dwelling. Refused. 02.03.2012

11/02716/LBC - Application for listed building consent for demolition of existing outbuilding and construction of a dwelling. Refused. 02.03.2012

13/00717/FUL - Alterations to existing outbuildings to form ancillary manager's accommodation for existing public house as amended by plan received by Hambleton District Council on 25 June 2013. Approved. 25.09.2013

13/00718/LBC - Application for listed building consent for alterations to existing outbuildings to form manager's accommodation for existing public house as amended by plan received by Hambleton District Council on 25 June 2013. Approved. 25.09.2013

14/00680/FUL - Construction of ancillary manager's accommodation as amended by plan received by Hambleton District Council on 14 May 2014. Approved. 30.05.2014

21/02474/MRC - Removal of condition of previously approved planning application reference Number: 14/00680/FUL - Construction of ancillary manager's accommodation - remove occupancy condition. Approved. 13.01.2022

21/02479/LBC - Retrospective listed building consent sought for internal alterations to return the first floor function room to its original use as manager/staff accommodation. Approved. 13.01.2022

ZB23/01932/FUL - Change of use from existing public house to dwelling. Concurrent application pending consideration.

## **4.0 SITE AND SURROUNDINGS**

- 4.1 The Horseshoe Public house is a Grade II listed building located on the east side of the main highway through the village of West Rounton. The building forms part of a short two storey terrace of three properties with the two properties to the north in residential use. The properties have rendered facades with pitched pantile roofs and are set back from the highway by c.10m. The frontage to the Horseshoe Public House is open and comprises a tarmac area used for parking and informal outdoor seating whilst to the north the residential properties have gardens defined by fencing and hedges. To the rear are two small single storey stone outbuildings used as storage together with an oil tank.
- 4.2 The submitted statements suggest the building was previously two separate dwellings with the dividing wall removed at ground floor level to provide a larger space at an unknown date. The public house is understood to have been operational since the c.19<sup>th</sup> century. As noted above in the planning history the building has been the subject of numerous applications in the latter half of the twentieth and into the early twenty-first centuries. Given the numerous modern interventions at ground floor level to provide bar counters, kitchen area, storage and W/C facilities associated with the current use, the heritage internal interest is limited to the staircase, two fireplaces and the existing entrance door. On this basis the heritage value of the site relates mainly to its historical use and limited architectural interest as a small village public house. The first-floor level is used as managers accommodation and the application excludes this area as no works are proposed.

## **5.0 DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL**

- 5.1 This application seeks permission for ground floor alterations which would facilitate the conversion to residential use. This application must consider the impact that the physical alterations would have on the significance of the listed building. The issues around the impact otherwise resulting from the change of use is dealt with in the concurrent Full application.
- 5.2 The proposed alterations would be minimal given the existing layout and functions that can be re-used. The kitchen area will remain and one of the W/C's will remain as a bathroom, whilst the remaining areas will be used for storage. The modern bar will be removed, and it is proposed to sub-divide the remaining space to form separate dining and living room areas. This approach would replicate the previous alignment of the dividing wall in similar a manner to when the building was understood to be in use as two dwellings. The only external alteration proposed is to remove the modern advertisement above the entrance door on the principal elevation.
- 5.3 During the course of the application the proposals to remove the existing outbuildings to the rear were omitted and the outbuildings are now proposed to be retained. Furthermore, an updated site layout has been provided to illustrate off-street parking and a small garden area to the front of the property.

## **6.0 PLANNING POLICY AND GUIDANCE**

- 6.1. Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that all planning authorities must determine each application under the Planning Acts in accordance with Development Plan so far as material to the application unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

#### Adopted Development Plan

6.2. The Adopted Development Plan for this site is:

Hambleton Local Plan, February 2022, and  
North Yorkshire Joint Waste and Minerals Plan, February 2022.

#### Emerging Development Plan – Material Consideration

6.3. The Emerging Development Plan for this site is listed below. It is considered to carry no weight due to the current early stage of plan preparation.

#### Guidance - Material Considerations

6.4. Relevant guidance for this application is:

- National Planning Policy Framework 2023 (NPPF)
- National Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)
- National Design Guide 2021 (NDG)

## 7.0 CONSULTATION RESPONSES

7.1. The following consultation responses have been received and have been summarised below:

7.2 West Rounton Parish Council: Object as summarised below:

- The loss of the Pub will be a great loss to the community.
- There is a local community interest group actively looking at ways the pub could be made more economically viable and improve its integration into the local fabric of the community.
- The local community interest group organized a meeting in the village hall and was well attended with between 35 to 40 people present.
- The Parish Council has submitted an application for the pub to be registered as an Asset of Community Value.
- Finally, it should be noted that the Parish councillors have individually put forward their objections.

7.3 The Council for British Archaeology: No response received (expired 27.10.2023).

7.4 Conservation officer: No objections subject to a condition requiring a schedule of works to be submitted in writing to the local planning authority. The schedule should include the order works shall be undertaken and how they are going to be removed and details of replacement elements.

7.5 Historic England: In this case we are not offering advice suggest that you seek the views of your specialist conservation and archaeological advisers.

#### Local Representations

7.6 A signed petition of 36 people and total of 5 individual local representations have been received in total on this listed building consent application. It should be noted that some of the observations are general comments relating to the loss of a community facility rather than specific heritage matters. A summary of the comments is provided below, however, please see Public Access for full comments:

## Petition

- Notes it is a place of historic value, it was built in circa 1860 and has served as the village pub since that time
- It is a Grade II listed building
- It is an asset of community value as it serves not only as a village pub but a place to meet for social gatherings and social well-being
- It's a great place for families to meet up and the children in the community to interact.
- And it could be so much more.

### Third party objections

- Concern regarding the loss of the only pub/community asset in the village.
- The recent loss of other local public houses such as the Station Inn at Picton and Shorthorn in Appleton Wiske would be a real loss to the wider community to lose another local public house especially one with such history.
- Unclear from the documents submitted as to the façade would be treated in any conversion.
- The value of the pub to the community extends way beyond its historic interest.
- Need to allow time for further investigation by the village community to consider whether it could be purchased by the community (with grants) or whether more intensive advertising could be employed to find a suitable buyer or tenant.

## 8.0 ENVIRONMENT IMPACT ASSESSMENT

- 8.1. The development proposed does not fall within Schedule 1 or 2 of the Environmental Impact Assessment Regulations 2017 (as amended). No Environment Statement is therefore required.

## 9.0 MAIN ISSUES

- 9.1. The key considerations in the assessment of this listed building application are:
- Heritage matters and the impact of the proposed physical alterations on the significance of the listed building.

## 10.0 ASSESSMENT

### Heritage

- 10.1 The main planning issue raised by this application is whether the proposed development would cause harm to the significance of the listed building.
- 10.2 Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that in determining a planning application for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the Local Planning Authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
- 10.3 The National Planning Policy Framework requires an assessment of the potential harm a proposed development would have upon the significance of a designated heritage asset and requires that harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing the optimum viable use of the building. Any harm identified must be given great weight in the determination of the application.

- 10.4 The heritage value of the subject building relates to its historical use as a small village public house and its architectural interest.
- 10.5 As noted in section 4 above, the building has been substantially altered and the limited proposed changes listed in section 5 to provide for the ground floor sub-division which would result in a minimal loss of historic fabric that would not impact upon the identified architectural significance of the heritage asset. No external alterations are proposed to the exterior with exception of the removal of the modern signage above the entrance door and this raises no concern. On this basis and subject to a schedule of works condition the proposal raises no heritage concerns in regard to the architectural significance of the building.
- 10.6 It is considered that that proposed physical alterations to the building result in no harm to the significance of the heritage asset.

## **11.0 PLANNING BALANCE AND CONCLUSION**

- 11.1. The National Planning Policy Framework requires the local planning authority to carry out a direct balance between harm to heritage assets and public benefit where harm to the significance is identified. Whilst the change of use is considered to result in harm, through the cultural impact of the loss of the public house, this application is only concerned with the physical alterations resulting from the proposals.
- 11.2. It is clear that where any harm is identified that harm must be given great weight and importance in the planning balance when determining an application concerning a designated heritage asset.
- 11.3. In this case, the physical alterations are considered to result in no harm and as such the proposed development is considered to meet the requirements of the National Planning Policy Framework. It is considered that the proposed development complies with the relevant Local Plan policy E5 in terms of heritage and is otherwise in accordance with local and national policy requirements

## **12.0 RECOMMENDATION:**

- 12.1 That listed building consent is **GRANTED** subject to conditions listed below:

### **RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS:**

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun within three years of the date of this permission.
2. Drawings Proposed Site plan and Proposed Floor plan.
3. Prior to the commencement of development a schedule of internal and external works shall be submitted in writing to the Local Planning Authority for approval. The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

### Reason

1. To ensure compliance with Section 18A of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended by the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. In order that the development is undertaken in a form that is appropriate to the character and appearance of its surroundings and in accordance with the Local Plan Policies S1 and E1.
3. In order that the development is undertaken in a form that is appropriate to the heritage asset in accordance with the Local Plan Policies S7 and E5.

**Target Determination Date:** 12.02.2024

**Case Officer:** Marc Pearson [marc.pearson@northyorks.gov.uk](mailto:marc.pearson@northyorks.gov.uk)